

NUMERICAL SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

ADDENDUM #1



Maple Leaf Farms Chicken Cordon Bleu Standard of Identity

06/06/2014 12:42 PM

Good Afternoon -

Thank you all for the meetings and correspondence regarding the Maple Leaf Farms Chicken Cordon Bleu petition pending at FSIS.

As a follow up to the meeting at USDA FSIS, Maple Leaf Farms was challenged with 2 primary objectives:

- 1) To produce numerical product composition data to support the claims being made in the petition with regard to product being sold in commerce under the title of "Chicken Cordon Bleu".
- 2) To produce direct consumer data to demonstrate consumer expectations as it relates to the product title "Chicken Cordon Bleu".

Numerical Composition Data:

Two restaurant chains in Warsaw, Indiana, the incorporated city closest to Maple Leaf Farms, serve "Chicken Cordon Bleu" on their menu: Arby's and Elmo's Pizza and Subs. At both establishments, five orders of "Chicken Cordon Bleu" were obtained and analyzed by weight for composition. The chicken component at Arby's was breaded, which does not count toward the chicken component per the current standard, so a 25% batter and breading pickup was assumed in the Arby's example. Neither the Arby's product or the Elmo's Pizza and Subs product met the stated 60% inclusion of chicken in the finished product. The full results are attached to this email. The summaries are below:

For Arby's:

Component	Average (g)	% of Total	Projected % Chicken Assuming 25% Batter and Breading Percentage
Bun	70.8	30.8	
Ham	47.6	20.7	
Breaded Patty	96.6	42.0	31.5
Cheese and Sauce	14.8	6.4	
Total	229.8	100	

For Elmo's Pizza and Subs:

Component	Average (g)	% of Total	Chicken Percentage No Batter or Breading / Marinated Chicken is 100%
Bun	115.8	56.0	
Ham	14.2	6.9	
Grilled Chicken	49.2	23.8	23.8
Cheese and Sauce	27.6	13.3	
Total	206.8	100.0	

Direct Consumer Data:

A firm in Fort Wayne, Indiana called Indiana Research has been contracted to complete a direct consumer evaluation on the definition of "Chicken Cordon Bleu" with a delivered summary expected by June 30. Upon the receipt of the research results, the report will be submitted to all parties for review.

With all requested information provided by Maple Leaf Farms on or before June 30, we will be in line with our discussion on completing a review of the petition on or before September 30, 2014.

Thank you all for your attention to this critical matter for our company.

~~_____~~
 Director of Marketing, Chicken Division



2014 Chicken Cordon Bleu Data Arby's and Elmo's.xlsx

~~_____~~
 This email message and any attachments may contain confidential information that is legally protected. This information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or action taken or reliance on the contents of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this information in error, please notify the sender immediately by replying to this message and delete the message from your system. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that disclosing, copying, distributing, or taking any action in reliance on the contents of this information is strictly prohibited.

CONSUMER PERCEPTION STUDY

ADDENDUM #2

Consumer Research with Regard to the Perception of Ingredients Present in "Chicken Cordon Bleu" and Analysis Compared to the Current FSIS Definition of "Chicken Cordon Bleu"

June 30, 2014

Background

A meeting between USDA FSIS and Maple Leaf Farms occurred on May 20, 2014. At that meeting, a request was made by USDA FSIS that Maple Leaf Farms submit consumer data to support the claim that the current USDA FSIS definition of "Chicken Cordon Bleu" was inconsistent with the current consumer perception of "Chicken Cordon Bleu".

Current USDA FSIS Standard of Identify Definition of "Chicken Cordon Bleu":

CHICKEN CORDON BLEU (FR):

Product must contain not less than:

1. 60 percent chicken breast meat (sliced). If it is made from any other part of the chicken, then the product name must be qualified to indicate the part used.
2. 5 percent ham or Canadian Style Bacon.
3. Cheese (either Swiss, Gruyere, Mozzarella, or Pasteurized Processed Swiss).
4. Not more than 30 percent batter and breading (if used).

The Study

Maple Leaf Farms contracted Indiana Research to conduct an online consumer test to reflect +/- 5% confidence error to answer the basic question of what consumers perceive as "Chicken Cordon Bleu". The question was asked open ended in two ways: one for retail segments and one for food service segments.

The retail question was:

"When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in the grocery store, what do you expect the product to contain?"

The food service question was:

"When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a restaurant, what ingredients do you expect to be served?"

The Demographics

In order to participate in the study, consumers had to have purchased poultry products in the grocery store within the last month, and the consumers had to eat out at least once per week. National trends for household income were to be reflected by participating respondents, so selection of consumers near the end of the study may have been necessary to ensure reflection of national household income trends. The study was conducted nationally within the United States online.

Gender:

Gender	Percentage	Raw Number
Female	49.24%	227
Male	50.76%	234

Age:

Age	Percentage	Raw Number
20 and younger	0.22%	1
21-24	5.64%	26
25-34	23.86%	110
35-49	29.50%	136
50-64	35.79%	165
65-69	4.77%	22
70+	0.22%	1

Household Income:

Income	Percentage	Raw Number
Less than 25k	3.33%	15
25K - 39,999	17.11%	77
40K - 59,999	21.33%	96
60K - 79,999	24.44%	110
80K - 99,999	16.67%	75
100K-125K	15.78%	71
More than 125K	1.33%	6
Skipped		11

The Data and Discussion About Components of the Standard of Identity Definition

Chicken

The standard of identity of “Chicken Cordon Bleu” as it relates to the chicken component states “60 percent chicken breast meat (sliced). If it is made from any other part of the chicken, then the product name must be qualified to indicate the part used.”

For the retail consumer question, “When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a grocery store, what do you expect the product to contain?” 233 of 380 participants (61%) referenced “Chicken” as an ingredient. 37 of 380 participants (10%) referenced “Chicken Breast” or “White Meat”. One consumer referenced a “10 ounce” chicken breast being a component; no other quantification of chicken was described by the other 379 participants. 114 of 380 participants (30%) answered some form of “don’t know” or “don’t buy” to the retail question.

For the food service consumer question, “When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a restaurant, what ingredients do you expect to be served?” 220 of 380 participants (58%) referenced “Chicken” as an ingredient. 30 of 380 participants (8%) referenced “Chicken Breast” or “White Meat”. One consumer referenced a “10 ounce” chicken breast being a component; no other quantification of chicken was described by the other 379 participants. 127 of 380 participants (33%) answered some form of “don’t know” or “don’t buy” or unreferenced “same as above”.

Discussion of “Chicken” as a Component

Only one consumer provided any quantification of the percentage or quantity of chicken present in “Chicken Cordon Bleu”. 99.7% of the consumers did not quantify “chicken” in any way, which is in contrast to the 60% minimum defined in the standard of identity. Also, only 8-10% of respondents identified with answers relative to chicken breast meat being used, 90-92% did not. The definition of Chicken Cordon Bleu as containing breast meat did not match the overall consumer expectation relative to the product.

Ham or Canadian Style Bacon

The standard of identity of “Chicken Cordon Bleu” as it relates to the ham or Canadian Style bacon component states “5 percent ham or Canadian style bacon.”

For the retail consumer question, “When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a grocery store, what do you expect the product to contain?” 193 of 380 participants (51%) referenced “Ham” as an ingredient. 3 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “Canadian Bacon” as an ingredient. 4 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “Bacon” as an ingredient. 3 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “Prosciutto” as an ingredient. One consumer referenced a “single piece of ham” as a quantifier. Another consumer

referenced a recipe that provided 2 oz. of ham per portion. 114 of 380 participants (30%) answered some form of “don’t know” or “don’t buy” to the retail question.

For the food service consumer question, “When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a restaurant, what ingredients do you expect to be served?” 180 of 380 participants (47%) referenced “Ham” as an ingredient. 1 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “Canadian Bacon” as an ingredient. 4 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “Bacon” as an ingredient. 2 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “Prosciutto” as an ingredient. 1 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “dried beef” as an ingredient. 1 of 380 participants (1%) referenced “Pork” as an ingredient. One consumer referenced a recipe that provided 2 oz. of ham per portion. 127 of 380 participants (33%) answered some form of “don’t know” or “don’t buy” or unreferenced “same as above”.

Discussion of “Ham or Canadian Style Bacon” as Components

Two consumers provided any quantification of the percentage or quantity of ham present in “Chicken Cordon Bleu”, one as a “single piece of ham” and the other averaging out to 2 oz. per 10 oz. chicken breast (20% of the chicken weight). 99.5% of the consumers did not quantify “ham or Canadian Bacon” in any way, which is in contrast to the 5% minimum defined in the standard of identity. Also, consumers referenced “Bacon”, “Prosciutto”, “Dried Beef”, and “Pork”, which present as ingredients perceived as components that are not addressed in the standard of identity at all. The consumer expectation as to the type of “Ham” is much more varied than the current definition allows.

Cheese

The standard of identity of “Chicken Cordon Bleu” as it relates to the cheese component states “Cheese (either Swiss, Gruyere, Mozzarella, or Pasteurized Processed Swiss).”

For the retail consumer question, “When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a grocery store, what do you expect the product to contain?” 223 of 380 participants (59%) referenced “Cheese” as an ingredient. 63 of 380 participants (17%) referenced “Swiss” specifically. 19 of 380 participants (5%) referenced “Bleu” specifically. By a 1% level each, “Cheddar”, “Mozzarella”, “Gruyere”, “Monterrey”, and “American” were also referenced specifically. One consumer referenced cheese as an ingredient equating to 1 oz. per 10 oz. Chicken Breast; no other quantification of cheese was noted. 114 of 380 participants (30%) answered some form of “don’t know” or “don’t buy” to the retail question.

For the food service consumer question, “When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a restaurant, what ingredients do you expect to be served?” 210 of 380 participants (55%) referenced “Cheese” as an ingredient. 56 of 380 participants (15%) referenced “Swiss” specifically. 15 of 380 participants (4%) referenced “Bleu” specifically. By a 1% level each, “Mozzarella”, “Gruyere”, and “Fontina” were also referenced specifically. One consumer referenced cheese as an ingredient equating to 1 oz. per 10 oz. Chicken Breast; no other quantification of cheese was noted. 127 of 380 participants (33%) answered some form of “don’t know” or “don’t buy” or unreferenced “same as above”.

Discussion of "Cheese" as a Component

"Cheese" is not quantified under the current standard of identity, and this matched the consumer perception overall. The types of cheese are limited by the current standard of identity for Cordon Bleu, which designates either Swiss, Gruyere, Mozzarella, or Pasteurized Processed Swiss. Consumers also described Chicken Cordon Bleu as containing Bleu Cheese, Cheddar, Monterrey, American, and Fontina cheeses. The consumer expectation as to the type of "Cheese" is much more varied than the current definition allows.

Batter and Breading

The standard of identity of "Chicken Cordon Bleu" as it relates to the batter and breading component states "Not more than 30 percent of batter and breading (if used)."

For the retail consumer question, "When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a grocery store, what do you expect the product to contain?" 69 of 380 participants (18%) referenced "Breaded" or "Coated" as an component. 3 of 380 participants (1%) referenced "light" coating in some way; no other quantitative measure was referenced. 114 of 380 participants (30%) answered some form of "don't know" or "don't buy" to the retail question.

For the food service consumer question, "When you purchase Chicken Cordon Bleu in a restaurant, what ingredients do you expect to be served?" 55 of 380 participants (14%) referenced "Breaded" or "Coated" as a characteristic. 1 of 380 participants (1%) referenced "light" coating; no other quantitative measure was referenced. 127 of 380 participants (33%) answered some form of "don't know" or "don't buy" or unreferenced "same as above".

Discussion of "Batter and Breading" as a Component

14-18% of consumers referenced a breaded product as a feature of Chicken Cordon Bleu, and 1% referenced "light" coating of the product. While a minority of consumers designated breading as a component, the phrase "light" would indicate lower batter and breading pickups during processing, which would be reflected in the current standard of identity of Chicken Cordon Bleu.

Discussion Key Points

Based on this study of poultry consumers,

- 1) Quantification of amounts of chicken or amounts of ham are not relevant to the perceived product definition of Chicken Cordon Bleu.
- 2) A strong minority 8-10% of respondents identify Chicken Cordon Bleu as Chicken Breast specific. Specifying the chicken part in the definition therefore may be unnecessary or not in agreement with general consumer expectations relative to the definition of Chicken Cordon Bleu.
- 3) The current definition of ham or Canadian Style bacon does not encompass all of the perceived possibilities of products of this type including prosciutto, bacon, and dried beef.
- 4) The current definition of cheese does not encompass all of the perceived possibilities of cheese. Notably excluded is Bleu Cheese, which may encourage the perception with the title of the product being "Chicken Cordon Bleu". Other cheeses described as expected ingredients included: Fontina, Cheddar, Monterrey, and American.
- 5) The current definition of the breading component does seem suitable to the expectation based on this study.

Revision of Petition Request Based on Supporting Evidence

Case Overview

Maple Leaf Farms has demonstrated:

- 1) Examples in domestic commerce of products labeled as “Chicken Cordon Bleu” including sandwiches, appetizers, and entrees. (original petition)
- 2) Examples of FSIS demonstrating difficulty in applying the current definition to product submissions. Labeling applications demonstrating this issue in interpretation are included in the original petition. (original petition)
- 3) Numerical supporting evidence of products being sold in commerce as “Chicken Cordon Bleu” that do not meet the current standard of identity. (Addendum 1)
- 4) Consumer perception data that demonstrates a lack of quantification of ingredients in consumer expectations as well as a broader interpretation of the pork component and the cheese component of “Chicken Cordon Bleu”. (Addendum 2)

Revised Proposed Standard of Identity for Chicken Cordon Bleu

Product must contain:

- 1) Chicken
- 2) An ingredient containing pork
- 3) Cheese or pasteurized processed cheese
- 4) Can be breaded or unbreaded

Or, Elimination of the Standard of Identity of Chicken Cordon Bleu

Alternatively, due to the broad nature of the use in commerce of “Chicken Cordon Bleu” and the broad expectations relative to the term “Chicken Cordon Bleu”, the standard of identity of “Chicken Cordon Bleu” should be eliminated entirely.